IMPLEMENTATION OF THE JIGSAW LEARNING MODEL TO IMPROVE STUDENT LEARNING OUTCOMES IN AKIDAH AKHLAK FOR GRADE VI AT MI PSM GEDORO

by Anggun Saskiya

Submission date: 18-Sep-2024 09:24AM (UTC+0700)
Submission ID: 2457504256
File name: CH_33_-_Anggun_Saskiya,_Dewi_Nur_Allipah,_Miftahul_Halima_1.pdf (571.83K)
Word count: 4854
Character count: 25865

IMPLEMENTATION OF THE JIGSAW LEARNING MODEL TO IMPROVE STUDENT LEARNING OUTCOMES IN AKIDAH AKHLAK FOR GRADE VI AT MI PSM GEDORO

Anggun Saskiya[1], Dewi Nur Allipah[2], Miftahul Halima[3]

[1]Faculty of Tarbiyah, Darussalam Gontor University, Ponorogo, 63471, Ponorogo, Indonesia,

[2]Faculty of Tarbiyah, Darussalam Gontor University, Ponorogo, 63471, Ponorogo, Indonesia

[3]Faculty of Tarbiyah, Darussalam Gontor University, Ponorogo, 63471, Ponorogo, Indonesia

Email: ndewallipah27@gmail.com

Abstract Akidah Akhlak as a subject in Islamic education at MI PSM Gedoro often faces challenges in student engagement due to its perceived monotony. In this study, the Jigsaw learning model is applied to address this issue, with the aim of clarifying the teacher's presentation of the material, addressing active student participation, and overcoming space limitations to make learning more effective. In this model, the teacher provides each student with the opportunity to study a portion of the material so that they become experts in their respective areas. This expertise is then taught to their peers in other groups. Peers in other groups also study different parts of the material and become experts in their areas. The interaction that occurs is a sharing pattern of learning, where each student gains high confidence due to having unique expertise needed by others. Each student will feel interdependent and reliant on others. The choice of the Jigsaw learning model for the Akidah Akhlak subject is intentionally made to engage students actively during the learning process, review previously learned material, gain a detailed understanding of the content, and build good cooperation among peers. Classroom Action Research (CAR) is used as the research methodology. The results of the first cycle show that 34.78% of students scored above 75, which increased to 82.61% in the second cycle. This indicates that the Jigsaw learning model effectively enhances student engagement and learning result.

Keywords: Jigsaw Learning Model,Akidah Akhlak, Learning Result.

1. Introduction

In this increasingly advanced era of globalization, education in Indonesia continues to develop in line with developments in science and technology (IPTEK). Problems often arise influenced by increasing student abilities, environmental situations and conditions, the influence of information and culture as well as developments in science and technology. The success of education in Indonesia is determined by learning activities carried out both in class, outside

of class, in the family and in the surrounding environment.

Education is a tool for changing humans to develop their human potential. Human potential is the seed of the possibility of becoming a good human being of quality. The aim of education is expected to be able to achieve results effectively and efficiently. Education is an important means of improving the quality of human resources (HR) in ensuring the success of human potential, abilities and capacities. Education for human life is a need that must be fulfilled throughout life. Without education, it is absolutely impossible for a group of people to live and develop in line with their aspirations (ideals). To progress, be prosperous and happy according to their concept of life view.

The learning process is the most important part of an educational activity. The learning process is an effort to achieve educational goals. Educational goals cannot be achieved without a learning process in an educational institution. Educational goals cannot be achieved without a learning process in an educational institution. To achieve perfect learning goals, teachers need to innovate in teaching and learning activities

The teaching and learning process is a process that contains a series of discussions between teachers and students on a reciprocal basis that takes place in an eductive situation to achieve certain goals. Interaction or reciprocal relationship between teachers and students is the main requirement for the learning process to take place. Interaction in teaching and learning events has a broader meaning, not just the relationship between teacher and student, but in the form of eductive interaction. In this case, it is not just conveying messages in the form of lesson material, but also instilling attitudes and values in students who are learning, the teacher consciously plans teaching activities systematically by utilizing everything for the benefit of teaching.

Teachers play a very important role in helping the development of students to realize their life goals optimally. This belief arises because humans are weak creatures, who in their development always need other people, from birth, even when they die. All of this shows that everyone needs other people in their development, as do students. When parents register their children at school, at that time they also place their hopes on the teacher, so that their children can develop optimally.

The subject of moral beliefs is a subject that aims to foster students' faith which is manifested in commendable moral actions. By providing students with knowledge about moral beliefs, it is hoped that their quality, faith and devotion to Allah SWT will increase, as well as

having noble morals in their personal, social, national and state lives. To make learning moral beliefs fun and easy for students to understand, teachers can apply learning models. The aim of applying the learning model to the subject of moral beliefs is to clarify the teacher's presentation in delivering lesson material, overcome students' active attitudes and overcome space limitations so that learning becomes more effective. If the application of the learning model is able to overcome problems in the learning process, especially in terms of delivering messages (material), then students will feel the positive impact and ultimately be able to improve learning achievement in the subject of moral beliefs.

One type of learning model is a jigsaw. This strategy is a structured group work strategy based on cooperation and responsibility. Jigsaw was developed and tested by Elliot Aroson and friends at the University of Texas, and adopted by Slavin and friends at John Hopkins University. Jigsaw is designed to provide fair learning opportunities to all students. Likewise, providing equal opportunities to be actively involved in learning. This is done by giving each student the opportunity to study parts of the teaching material so that he or she will become an expert in their field. These skills are then taught to colleagues in other groups. Colleagues in other groups also study other teaching materials and become experts in their fields. The interaction that occurs is a sharing learning pattern, each student will have a high sense of self-confidence because they have their own skills that other students need. Each student will feel that they need each other and are dependent on other students.

This strategy is an interesting strategy to use if the material to be studied can be divided into several parts and the material does not require the order of delivery.

The steps for learning jigsaw are:

1. Students are divided into several groups (each group has 5-6 members)
2. Study material is given to students in text form which has been divided into several sub-chapters.
3. Each group member reads the assigned sub-chapter and is responsible for studying it. For example, if the material presented is about the excretory system, then a student from one group learns about it
4. Members of other groups who have studied the same subchapter meet in expert groups to discuss it.
5. After each member of the expert group returns to their group, they are tasked with teaching their friends.

6. At home group meetings and discussions, students are billed in the form of individual quizzes.
7. The teacher gives an evaluation
8. Closing

The following is a brief explanation of the interview between the researcher and the teacher:

Q: What obstacles did you encounter in the process of learning Aqidah morals?

G: in the process of learning Aqidah morals, students are less enthusiastic about participating in the lesson

Q: In learning moral Aqidah, what model or learning method do you use?

G: as in general, sis, like lectures, discussions, assignments.

Based on the description above, it is necessary for a teacher to take action to find and implement a learning model that can improve student learning result in the subject of Moral Aqeedah. The researcher tried to develop a jigsaw learning model in the Aqidah Moral learning subject with the aim of making it easier for students to learn to understand the lesson material and making the learning process not boring, but the learning would be fun and interesting for students. Therefore, the researcher tried to conduct classroom action research entitled "application of the jigsaw learning model to improve the learning result of Aqidah Morals for class V MI PSM GEDORO NGAWI academic year 2023-2024".

2. Materials and Methods

Research Types and Designs

In this research, the method used is the Classroom Action Research method because the researcher acts directly in the research, starting from the beginning to the end of the action. The term Classroom Action Research (CAR) is used for teachers who intend to improve the quality of learning through providing action to students. Classroom Action Research itself is research where the root of the problem arises in the classroom, and is felt directly by the teacher concerned, so it is difficult to justify if there is a response that the problems in PTK are obtained from the perception of a researcher. (Suharsimi,18).

Thus, it can be said that PTK is research that describes both the process and results carried out in class to improve the quality of learning, both learning result and student activity in learning.

In this research, the researcher examined a research object regarding improving the learning result of class VI MI PSM Gedoro students through the "jigsaw" learning model.

So in the teaching and learning process there

will definitely be a lesson that has problems and will be researched. That lesson is the Moral Aqidah at MI PSM Gedoro. So Akiah Akhlak lessons are lessons that exist in every institution in the Madrasah. In the process of this research, the researcher has discovered a problem in learning Aqidah Akhlak which must be resolved in learning and teaching activities between students and MI PSM Gedoro teachers.

1. **Data collection technique**

The data collection method used in this research is as follows:

a. The data source in this research is class VI students at MI PSM Gedoro.
b. The types of data in this research consist of 2 types, namely: first, interviews at MI PSM Gedoro; second, observation data on plans and learning processes carried out by researchers and collaborators.
c. The method of collecting data in research is carried out by researchers and collaborators during the learning process which is carried out in 3 ways, namely first, by observing how students learn. Second, with a test technique in the form of practice using a "jigsaw". Third, use field notes to record all student and teacher activities during the lesson.

2. **Data Analysis Techniques**

Data from student learning test results were analyzed together with collaborators (observers). Furthermore, the data collected after tabulation and scoring are interpreted using theoretical studies that have been developed, as well as using empirical experiences that teachers often experience when carrying out learning in class. Criteria for reflecting data or target limits for improving student learning using the following criteria:

Value Range	Criteria
86-100	Very well
70-85	Good
60-70	Enough
50-59	Not enough
0-49	Very less

Furthermore, verification was also carried out using interviews to find out directly about the improvement in student learning result through the application of the learning modelJigsawin the Moral Creed Subject.

The Concept of Learning Result

In general, it can be defined that learning result are students' self-assessment and changes that can be observed, proven and measurable in abilities or achievements experienced by students as a result of learning experiences (Sobandi 2016). Learning result are the result of a person's learning process. Learning result are related to changes in the person who learns. Forms of change as a result of learning

are changes in knowledge, understanding, attitudes and behavior, skills and abilities. Change in the sense of changes caused by growth is not considered a learning outcome. Changes as a result of learning are relatively permanent and have the potential to develop. (Lestari 2015)

According to Nana Sudjana, learning result are a competency or skill that can be achieved by students after going through learning activities designed and implemented by teachers in a particular school and class. (Nurrita 2018)

Learning result can be used as a benchmark for identifying and evaluating learning objectives. As one of the benchmarks for measuring the success of the learning process, learning result reflect the results of the learning process which shows the extent to which students, teachers, learning processes and educational institutions have achieved predetermined educational goals. (Rasto 2019)

In the entire educational process at school, learning activities are the most basic activities, this means that the success or failure of achieving educational goals depends a lot on how the learning process is experienced by students as students. Student success in the learning process can be influenced by factors from within the individual and from outside the individual. Factors within the individual include physical and psychological, examples of psychological factors include motivation, learning is done to achieve a certain goal. (Wahyu Bagja Sulfemi 2018)

Factors that influence student learning result are internal factors and external factors. Internal factors are physiological conditions and psychological conditions. Psychological conditions include:

1. Intelligence (intelligence)
2. Interest
3. Motivation
4. Cognitive abilities
5. Concentration.

Meanwhile, external factors in learning result are environmental factors and instrumental factors. These instrument factors include:

1. Curriculum
2. Program
3. Facilities and infrastructure
4. Teachers and teaching staff. (Naswan 2014)

Jigsaw learning Model Concept

The jigsaw learning model is a learning technique, which makes students have greater responsibility in implementing learning than teachers. Where students carry out group discussions with three group stages, namely the original stage, the expert stage, and the five-fold stage. Learning objectives create a situation where

student success is determined by the success of their group, to achieve effective and efficient learning. (Djabba 2020)

In the Jigsaw type cooperative learning model, there are home groups and expert groups. The home group is the parent group of students consisting of students with diverse abilities, origins and family backgrounds. The original group is a combination of several experts. Expert groups are groups of students consisting of members from different home groups who are assigned to study and explore a particular topic and complete tasks related to the topic which are then explained to members of the home group. (Gusti Made and Adi Widarta 2020)

The jigsaw learning model can also facilitate students to think actively, creatively and innovatively in the learning process. With this learning model students develop intellectually, emotionally develop, develop skills, as well as the emotions and potential that students have, by implementing the jigsaw learning model to train students Students dare to express opinions, develop themselves, work together, take responsibility individually and develop personal interactions. (Yahya Eko Nopiyanto 2020)

According to Elliot Aronson, implementing a jigsaw class includes 10 stages, namely:

1. divide students into Jigsaw groups of 5-6 people
2. assign one student from each group as a leader, generally an adult student in that group.
3. divide the lessons to be discussed into 5-6 segments;
4. Assign each student to learn one segment and to master their own segment
5. give the students the opportunity to quickly read their segment at least twice so that they get used to it and there is no time to memorize,
6. Form expert groups with one person from each jigsaw group joining other students who have the same segment to discuss the main points of their segment and practice presenting to their jigsaw group.
7. Each student from the expert group returns to their jigsaw group.
8. Ask each student to convey the segment they have learned to their group, and give other students the opportunity to ask questions.
9. The teacher goes around from one group to another, observing the process. If a student is disruptive, appropriate intervention is immediately made by the assigned group leader.

10. At the end of the section, give a test on the material so that students know that this section is not just a game but actually calculating (Harahap 2016)

Results and Discussion

In the results and discussion section, the author will explain the data we obtained through the learning cycle process starting from implementation, planning, observation, and the results of classroom action research which took place at MI PSM Gedoro class VI in the Aqidah Akhlak subject.

1. **Cycle Action 1**

In the Planning Stage of this first cycle, the researcher created a lesson plan as a learning implementation plan that had been adapted to the jigsaw learning model. Prepare questions regarding the subject matter being studied as a measure of the completeness of students' learning result. Make observation sheets as a tool or instrument for observing how active students are in learning.

Action Implementation Phase The first cycle carries out teaching and learning activities in accordance with the action plan that has been prepared in the RPP. The learning steps in this cycle are as follows: Initial Activities, Opening the lesson, Conveying learning objectives, Asking questions related to the material that has been studied, Core Activities, The teacher begins with a brief explanation of the material to be studied, and also explains the relationship with previously studied material.

Learning begins with an introduction first, then the teacher takes attendance so that the teacher can get to know the students one by one before starting the lesson. Then the teacher continues the lesson with an explanation of the material on commendable morals, then the teacher asks the students to open the textbook, the students and teacher study the material in the textbook simultaneously, in this process the teacher gives students the opportunity to understand the material according to what they understand.

At the end of the lesson, the teacher distributes exercises in the form of questions about the material or chapters that have been studied previously. The point is that an evaluation can be taken of the teaching and learning process, so that it can be improved at the next meeting. The teacher gives 10 minutes to work on the questions. Once finished, the female students submit their answers to the teacher. The teacher invites the female students to pray together after studying so that what they have learned can be useful. The teacher says greetings and the class is dismissed.

The observation stage is carried out simultaneously with the learning process taking place. At this stage, observations are carried out to obtain data on student activity which influences the completion of student learning result. This observation is measured through an observation sheet, which is attached as follows:

Table 1: Observation Results of Student Activeness Cycle 1

Category	Number of Students
Very good	5
Good	4
Enough	9
Not enough	6

Based on the attached table above, it can be concluded that students' activeness in learning is not optimal. In this first cycle the teacher still uses the lecture method in delivering the material. Learning that is still monotonous seems boring and does not attract students' attention in learning. Of the 6 students, it was recorded that 3 were not focused, 1 student fell asleep because he was not feeling well, and 2 students were recorded as 2 children were seen chatting. Furthermore, the other 9 students have not focused themselves during the learning process. The number of 9 students who are active in class among their total of 23 students is not a large number so that in the next cycle the teacher must be able to provide new innovations in the teaching process, so that it can attract attention. female students regarding the lessons he brought.

In the reflection stage, the researcher begins with an assessment and evaluation of student learning result, which will then explain the completeness of the learning result in the Aqidah Akhlak subject in cycle 1, which are measured through practice questions provided by the teacher at the end of the lesson, as follows:

Table 2: Completeness of Cycle 1 Student Learning Results

Category	Number of Students	Percentage
Complete	8	35%
Not Completed	15	65%

The data results showed that 8 students got a score of 75 and above, with a percentage of 25%. It can be concluded that learning result are still far from the target of the Minimum Completion Criteria or what is called KKM. The KKM target in this subject is 75%. So, there is a need to improve learning methods. We plan to increase this by using a jigsaw learning model designed by the teacher as well as a learning model in the

subject of moral beliefs in class VI at MI PSM Gedoro Ngawi.

The reflection results are based on observation data on student activity and data on assessing the completeness of student learning result. The learning in the first cycle had not reached the target of completeness, therefore this classroom action research was continued in the second cycle as an improvement on the previous cycle.

2. Cycle Action 2

The second cycle is a follow-up to the teaching and learning process activities from the previous first cycle. There are stages carried out to increase the completeness of learning result which is the goal of the learning process.

In the planning stage, action plans are prepared based on evaluation notes and reflections from the first cycle of actions, including, designing a more interesting jigsaw as a learning model, making observation sheets of student activity in the classroom, preparing practice questions as a benchmark for the completeness of the participants' learning result educate.

The lesson begins with an ice breaker to attract students' attention and focus before starting the lesson, then the teacher asks the students trigger questions to see to what extent the students know and understand the praiseworthy sentence. In the implementation stage, activities are carried out in accordance with the action plan that has been prepared. The learning steps in the second cycle are as follows. In the initial activity the teacher opens the lesson, conveys the learning objectives, asks questions related to the material that has been studied. In the core activity, the teacher begins with a brief explanation of the material to be studied, and also explains its relationship to the material previously studied. The teacher explains the material using a jigsaw model that he had previously designed. In explanations, teachers must be able to make students more active in learning in class. The explanation of the jigsaw learning model ends with providing conclusions for each group and similarities in understanding regarding the material.

At the end of the lesson, the teacher distributes exercises in the form of questions about the material or chapters that have been studied previously. The point is that an evaluation can be taken of the teaching and learning process, so that it can be improved at the next meeting. The teacher gives 10 minutes to work on the questions. Once finished, the students submit their answers to the teacher, then the teacher invites the students to pray together. After studying so that what has been learned can provide benefits, at the end of the

teaching and learning activity the teacher greets and invites the students to leave the classroom.

The observation stage in the second cycle was carried out the same as in the first cycle, namely at the same time as the learning process was taking place. At this stage, observations are carried out to obtain data on activity in the learning process. This observation is carried out through an observation sheet, as follows.

Table 3: Observation results of student activity in cycle 2

Category	Number of Students
Very good	8
Good	11
Enough	3
Not enough	1

The results of observations in this second cycle showed an increase in students' attention to the teacher's explanation. Before discussing the material in the book, the teacher did not invite students to open their books, and instructed them to focus on the teacher's explanation. When the teacher explained the jigsaw learning model accompanied by discussion and exchanging ideas, the students' enthusiasm was visible in paying attention to the teacher's explanation and the discussion of each group. Class conditions look conducive and enjoyable. Students also appear active by asking and discussing things they don't understand.

The class looked increasingly busy when the students asked each other questions at each group during the discussion of the sub-material provided by the teacher. The students also answered with ideas and concepts that they understood from the results of discussions with the group. This can improve students' thinking processes, where they broadly and actively understand the material in their language. Slowly but surely, the teacher leads them to the same concept, the correct concept.

At the reflection stage in cycle 2, the researcher explained the assessment and evaluation of student learning result and the completeness of learning result in the Islamic. Date subject in cycle 2, following the presentation of the results of the assessment and evaluation of completeness in cycle 2:

Tabel 4: Ketuntasan Hasil Belajar Siswa Siklus 2

Kategori	Jumlah Siwa	Persentase
Tuntas	19	82,61%
Belum Tuntas	4	17,39%

From the presentation of the data above, it can be seen that the number of students who obtained a score of 75 and above was 19 students, with a percentage of 83%. and 4 students with a score of less than 75 with a percentage of 17%. The target percentage of completion in this PTK is 75%. So

the results of the reflection are based on observation data on student activity and data on assessing the completeness of student learning result. learning in this second cycle has achieved the target of completion.

Discussion

Based on the data obtained from cycles 1 and 2, it can be seen that there is an increase in the activity and learning mastery of the students. In the first cycle, there were 8 students who were actively listening, understanding, and asking questions during the teaching and learning process. Meanwhile, in the second cycle, there was an increase, with 19 students actively participating during the learning process.

Furthermore, the learning mastery of the students also showed improvement. In the first cycle, 8 students achieved mastery in their learning outcomes, with a percentage of 34.78%. In the second cycle, there was an increase, with 19 students achieving learning mastery, reaching a percentage of 82.61%. This is presented as follows:

- Cycle 1: Mastery 34.78%, not yet mastery 65.22%
- Cycle 2: Mastery 82.61%, not yet mastery 17.39%.

3. Conclusion

Based on the results and discussion above, the researcher concluded that the use of the jigsaw learning model was able to improve the learning outcomes of class VI students in the moral aqidah lesson at MI PSM Gedoro Ngawi. Based on the results of the data that has been achieved, there has been an increase and improvement in learning, where in the first cycle it was 35%, and in the second cycle it was 83%. Apart from that, the level of student activity also increased, namely from cycle 1 where there were 9 active students, and in the second cycle there were 19 students. With this jigsaw learning model, students can understand and be active in learning. And with this learning model, students begin to develop and attract their attention, thereby increasing their enthusiasm for learning, which was initially boring due to monotonous learning, as well as the shortcomings of books that looked less interesting and the absence of questions for practice. With the jigsaw learning model, the class looks livelier, more enthusiastic, because it attracts them to discuss the sub-material provided by the teacher.

REFERENCE

Djabba, Rasmi. ""APPLICATION OF THE JIGSAW TYPE COOPERATIVE LEARNING MODEL IN IMPROVING THE SCIENCE

LEARNING RESULT OF CLASS V STUDENTS OF STATE PRIMARY SCHOOL 48 PAREPARE THE IMPLEMENTATION OF COOPERATIVE LEARNING MODEL JIGSAW TYPE IN IMPROVING STUDE." 2020.

Gusti Made and Adi Widarta, . ""“IMPLEMENTATION OF A JIGSAW TYPE COOPERATIVE LEARNING MODEL TO INCREASE MOTIVATION AND HASIL ." 2020.

Harahap, Nur Ainun Lubis and Hasrul. "Jigsaw Type Cooperative Learning." 2016.

Lestari, Indah. "The Influence of Study Time and Interest in Learning on Mathematics Learning Result." *Formatif: Scientific Journal of Mathematics and Natural Sciences Education* , 2015.

Naswan, Ayu Desy N. Endah Lulup T P. and Suharsono. ""The Influence of Learning Motivation and Spiritual Learning Activities on Accounting Learning Result." *Economic Journal 4*, 2014.

Nur Ainun Lubis and Hasrul Harahap, “Jigsaw Type Cooperative Learning. 2016.

Nurrita. ""Development of Learning Media to Improve Student Learning Result." *Misykat 03* , 2018.

Rasto, Rike Andriani and Rasto. "Learning Motivation as a Determinant of Student Learning Result." *Journal of Office Management Education* , 2019.

Sobandi, Siti Nurhasanah and A. "Interest in Learning as a Determinant of Student Learning Result." *Journal of Office Management Education* , 2016.

Wahyu Bagja Sulfemi, . " "The Relationship between Learning Motivation and Social Studies Learning Result in Middle Schools in Bogor Regency," ." *Educational Reflections: Educational Scientific Journal*, 2018.

Yahya Eko Nopiyanto, Septian Raibowo, and Bengkulu University. "Application of the Jigsaw Learning Model to Increase Physical Education Students' Motivation and Learning Result in Physical Education and Sports Philosophy Coursesa." 2020.

IMPLEMENTATION OF THE JIGSAW LEARNING MODEL TO IMPROVE STUDENT LEARNING OUTCOMES IN AKIDAH AKHLAK FOR GRADE VI AT MI PSM GEDORO

ORIGINALITY REPORT

13%	11%	%	5%
SIMILARITY INDEX	INTERNET SOURCES	PUBLICATIONS	STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	download.atlantis-press.com Internet Source	1%
2	www.journal.bungabangsacirebon.ac.id Internet Source	1%
3	journal.aripi.or.id Internet Source	1%
4	e-journal.unmas.ac.id Internet Source	1%
5	journal.iaiddipolman.ac.id Internet Source	1%
6	repository.ummat.ac.id Internet Source	1%
7	Submitted to Edison State College Student Paper	1%
8	jpk.joln.org Internet Source	1%
	ejournal.unis.ac.id	

9	Internet Source	1 %
10	www.i3trainingservices.com Internet Source	<1 %
11	Submitted to IAIN Pekalongan Student Paper	<1 %
12	ejournal.karinosseff.org Internet Source	<1 %
13	journal.amca2012.org Internet Source	<1 %
14	ojs.staialfurqan.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
15	psppjournals.org Internet Source	<1 %
16	pedirresearchinstitute.or.id Internet Source	<1 %
17	repository.uin-malang.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
18	Submitted to Portage Central High School Student Paper	<1 %
19	Submitted to Universiti Teknologi Mara Student Paper	<1 %
20	ojs.unimal.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %

21	Submitted to Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta Student Paper	<1%
22	Submitted to Middlesex University Student Paper	<1%
23	Submitted to University of Witwatersrand Student Paper	<1%
24	cahaya-ic.com Internet Source	<1%
25	Submitted to Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris Student Paper	<1%
26	download.garuda.kemdikbud.go.id Internet Source	<1%
27	www.journalfkipuniversitasbosowa.org Internet Source	<1%
28	eudl.eu Internet Source	<1%
29	journal2.um.ac.id Internet Source	<1%
30	digilib.unimed.ac.id Internet Source	<1%

Exclude quotes	Off	Exclude matches	Off
Exclude bibliography	On		